

CONTENTS

Foreword by AEA	1
 SECTION 1 – Brief outline of cases that could occur before a national court.....	 3
1. Outline of cases that could occur before a national court	5
1.1. Procedure relating to State aids	5
1.2. Enforcement by the European Commission.....	6
1.3. Direct effect of Article 93(3)	7
1.4. The enforcement of negative Commission decisions	8
1.5. The implementation of positive Commission decisions	9
 SECTIONS 2 and 3 – Availability of judicial relief under the legal systems of individual Member States – List of cases with summarie	 11
AUSTRIA	
2. Outline on the availability of judicial relief under the legal system of Austria.....	15
2.1. Actions taken by competitors.....	16
2.1.1. Cease and desist.....	16
2.1.2. Damages	19
2.2. Actions for recovery.....	20
2.2.1. Aid granted by way of contract.....	20
2.2.2. Aid granted by way of an individual administrative act (Bescheid).....	21
3. Case summary	21
BELGIUM	
2. Outline on the availability of judicial relief under the Belgian legal system	25
2.1. Procedures concerning the direct effect of Article 93(3).....	25
2.1.1. Procedure against the recipient of the aid	25
2.1.2. Procedures against the Agency which granted the aid	25
2.2. Procedures concerning the enforcement of negative Commission decisions.....	26
3. List of cases with summaries	27
3.1 Decision of the Supreme Court (<i>Cour de Cassation</i>) of Belgium of 18th June 1992 (A)	27
3.2. Decision of the Commercial Court (<i>Tribunal de Commerce</i>) of Brussels of 3rd December 1981 (C)	27
3.3 Decision of the Commercial Court (<i>Tribunal de Commerce</i>) of Brussels dated February 13th 1995 (H).....	28
3.4 Decision of the Commercial Court (<i>Tribunal de Commerce</i>) of Gent of February the 25th 1994 (A)	28

3.5	Decision of the State Council of 18th May 1982 (D)	29
-----	--	----

DENMARK

2.	Member State system : Denmark.....	33
2.1.	The direct effect of Article 93(3).....	33
2.2.	The enforcement of negative Commission decisions.....	34
2.3.	The implementation of positive Commission decisions.....	35
3.	Member State cases.....	35

FINLAND

2.	Outline on the availability of judicial relief under the legal system of Finland	39
2.1.	Procedures concerning the direct effect of Article 93(3).....	39
2.1.1.	Procedures before administrative courts	39
2.1.2.	Procedures before civil courts	40
2.2.	Procedures concerning the enforcement of negative Commission decisions	40
2.3.	Procedures concerning the implementation of positive Commission decisions.....	41
3.	List of cases with summaries	41

FRANCE

2.	Availability of procedures in France	45
2.1.	Division of jurisdiction between Administrative Courts and Civil Courts.....	45
2.2.	Procedures concerning the direct effect of Article 93(3).....	47
2.2.1.	Administrative courts.....	47
2.2.2.	Civil courts	48
2.3.	Negative and positive decisions of the Commission	49
2.3.1.	Enforcement of negative Commission decisions	49
2.3.2.	Implementation of positive Commission decisions	49
2.4.	Liability of Member States for breach of EC State aid law	50
3.	List of cases with summaries	51
3.1.	Opinion No 89-A-11 of the Competition Council of 11 July 1989 (D)	51
3.2.	Administrative Court of Appeal, Paris, S.A Lesieur Alimentaire, 27 June 1991(B).....	53
3.3.	Administrative Court of Appeal, Nantes, S.A Tartrou, 9 October 1991 (B)	54
3.4.	Administrative Court of Appeal, Nancy, SARL Decoster, 26 December 1991 (B)	55
3.5.	Civil Supreme Court, Lener Ignace/Textile, 12 May 1993 (A)	55
3.6.	Civil Supreme Court, Le Moulin Rouge Ponard, 23 November 1993 (B)	58
3.7.	Administrative Supreme Court, "Association la Vache à lait qui refuse de se laisser traire", 17 April 1994 (B).....	59
3.8.	Opinion n° 94-A-15 of the Competition Council of 10 May 1994 (C).....	59
3.9.	Administrative Supreme Court, SCA du Piada, 1 June 1994 (B).....	60
3.10.	Civil Supreme Court, Limagne Sanders, 18 October 1994 (B).....	62

3.11.	Administrative Supreme Court, Société Saumon Pierre Chevance, 9 November 1994 (B)	63
3.12.	Civil Supreme Court, Bourgogne Sanders, 20 February 1996 (B) ...	64
3.13.	Civil Supreme Court, Société Minoterie Joseph Nicot, 20 February 1996 (B)	65
3.14.	Opinion n° 96-A-10 of the Competition Council of 25 June 1996 (D).....	66
3.15.	Civil Supreme Court, Société Guyomarch, 26 November 1996 (B)	67
3.16.	Civil Supreme Court, Société Sanders Aliments SNC, 7 January 1997 (B)	68
3.17.	Administrative Supreme Court, Société Baxter e.a., 28 March 1997 (B).....	68
3.18.	Civil Supreme Court, Société Ralston Purina France, 27 May 1997 (B).....	69
3.19.	Civil Supreme Court, Société Chambe, 2 December 1997 (B).....	71
3.20.	Civil Supreme Court, Commercial Chamber, Huttepain Maine Aliments SA, 16 June 1998 (B)	72
3.21.	The "Boussac" case (A).....	73
3.22.	The "Fenacomex" case known as the "Saumon" case (D).....	76
3.23.	The "SFEI" vs "la Poste" case (F).....	78

GERMANY

2.	Outline of the availability of judicial relief under the German legal system ..	93
2.1.	Procedures concerning the direct effect of Article 93(3).....	93
2.1.1.	Procedure before administrative courts	93
2.1.2.	Procedure before civil courts.....	96
2.1.3.	Special remedies under the rules on public procurement	98
2.2.	Procedures concerning the enforcement of negative Commission decision	98
2.3.	Procedures concerning the implementation of positive Commission decisions.....	99
3.	List of cases with summaries	100
3.1.	Administrative Court (<i>Verwaltungsgericht</i>) of Magdeburg, order of 2 September 1998 (D).....	100
3.2.	« Alcan Case »	101
3.3.	Federal Constitutional Court (<i>Bundesverfassungsgericht</i>), judgment of 3 December 1997 (A).....	104
3.4.	Higher Administrative Court (<i>Verwaltungsgerichtshof</i>) of Baden-Württemberg, judgment of 10 December 1996 (A)	105
3.5.	State Social Court of Northrhine-Westphalia (<i>Landessozialgericht Nordrhein-Westfalen</i>), judgment of 22 March 1996 (B).....	106
3.6.	Higher Administrative Court of Northrhine-Westphalia (<i>Oberverwaltungsgericht Nordrhein-Westfalen</i>), order of 19 December 1995 and Administrative Court (<i>Verwaltungsgericht</i>) of Aachen, order of 14 December 1994 (D)	107
3.7.	Higher Administrative Court of Hamburg (<i>Hamburgisches Oberverwaltungsgericht</i>), judgment of 14 February 1995 and Administrative	

	Court (<i>Verwaltungsgericht</i>) of Hamburg, judgment of 2 June 1993 (A).....	108
3.8.	Federal Administrative Court (<i>Bundesverwaltungsgericht</i>), judgment of 7 July 1994 (B).....	109
3.9.	Higher Administrative Court of Lower Saxony (<i>Niedersächsisches Oberverwaltungsgericht</i>), order of 30 May 1994 and Administrative Court (<i>Verwaltungsgericht</i>) of Hanover, order of 27 May 1994 (D)	110
3.10.	Federal Administrative Court (<i>Bundesverwaltungsgericht</i>), judgment of 4 August 1993 (B)	111
3.11.	Federal Administrative Court (<i>Bundesverwaltungsgericht</i>), judgment of 12 May 1993 (B)	112
3.12.	Federal Administrative Court (<i>Bundesverwaltungsgericht</i>), judgment of 17 February 1993, Higher Administrative Court (<i>Oberverwaltungsgericht</i>) of Münster, judgment of 26 November 1991 and Administrative Court (<i>Verwaltungsgericht</i>) of Cologne, judgment of 21 April 1988 (A)	112
3.13.	Administrative Court (<i>Verwaltungsgericht</i>) of Frankfurt, reference for a preliminary ruling by ECJ of 11 December 1991 (B)	114
3.14.	Labour Court (<i>Arbeitsgericht</i>) of Reutlingen, reference for a preliminary ruling by order of 3 May 1991 (B)	114
3.15.	Federal Social Court (<i>Bundessozialgericht</i>), judgment of 24 January 1991 and Bavarian State Social Court (<i>Bayerisches Landessozialgericht</i>) of Munich, judgment of 7 February 1990 (B)	115
3.16.	Labour Court (<i>Arbeitsgericht</i>) of Bremen, order of 9 October 1990 (B)	116
3.17.	Federal Social Court (<i>Bundessozialgericht</i>), judgment of 4 October 1988 (B)	117
3.18.	Federal Administrative Court (<i>Bundesverwaltungsgericht</i>), order of 19 December 1986 (B)	117
3.19.	Federal Administrative Court (<i>Bundesverwaltungsgericht</i>), judgment of 15 May 1984 (B)	117
3.20.	Fiscal Court (<i>Finanzgericht</i>) of Hamburg, judgment of 17 April 1984 (B)	118
3.21.	Higher Administrative Court (<i>Oberverwaltungsgericht</i>) Münster, judgment of 22 September 1982 (D).....	118
3.22.	Fiscal Court (<i>Finanzgericht</i>) of Hamburg, judgment of 31 October 1980 (B)	119
3.23.	Fiscal Court (<i>Finanzgericht</i>) of Hamburg, reference for a preliminary ruling by the ECJ dated 31 October 1980 (B)	119
3.24.	Fiscal Court (<i>Finanzgericht</i>) of Hamburg, reference for a preliminary ruling by the ECJ dated 22 March 1978 (B).....	120
3.25.	Fiscal Court (<i>Finanzgericht</i>) of Hamburg, reference for a preliminary ruling by the ECJ dated 24 October 1977 (B).....	120
3.26.	Administrative Court (<i>Verwaltungsgericht</i>) of Frankfurt, reference for a preliminary ruling by the Federal Constitutional Court (<i>Bundesverfassungsgericht</i>) dated 28 July 1977 (B).....	120

3.27.	Fiscal Court (<i>Finanzgericht</i>) of Hessen, judgment of 12 March 1974 (B).....	121
3.28.	Federal Fiscal Court (<i>Bundesfinanzhof</i>), judgment of 1 March 1974 (B).....	122
3.29.	Fiscal Court (<i>Finanzgericht</i>) of <i>Baden-Württemberg</i> , reference for a preliminary ruling by the ECJ dated 29 April 1970 (B)	122
3.30.	Fiscal Court (<i>Finanzgericht</i>) of Munich, reference for preliminary ruling by ECJ dated by 23 February 1970 (B).....	122

GREECE

2.	Outline on the availability of judicial relief under the legal system of Greece.....	127
2.1.	General introduction to Hellenic Administrative law provisions	127
2.2.	Procedures concerning the direct effect of Article 93(3).....	128
2.3.	Action for damages	130
2.4.	Injunction proceedings.....	130
2.5.	Locus standi in lawsuits against decisions addressed to other parties	131
2.6.	The enforcement of negative Commission decisions.....	132
2.7.	The implementation of positive Commission decisions.....	132

IRELAND

2.	Outline on the availability of judicial relief under the legal system of Ireland	137
2.1.	Judicial Review.....	137
2.1.1.	Certiorari, prohibition, mandamus – Order 84, rule 18(1) ...	137
2.1.2.	Declaration, injunction - Order 84, rule 18(2).....	137
2.1.3.	Procedure	138
2.2.	Tort.....	138
2.2.1.	Procedure	139
3.	Irish cases concerning the application of Articles 92 and/or 93	139

ITALY

2.	Availability of procedures in Italy	143
2.1.	Direct applicability of EC legislation	143
2.2.	Application of Article 93(3) by Italian Courts	143
2.3.	Effects of the infringement of Article 93 in the Italian Legal System.	145
2.3.1.	General	145
2.3.2.	Constitutional Court.....	146
2.3.3.	Administrative Courts	149
2.3.4.	Civil Courts.....	150
3.	Member State cases.....	151
3.1.	Proceedings before the Constitutional Court (Corte Costituzionale).....	151
3.1.1.	Constitutional Court (<i>Corte Costituzionale</i>), Judgment of 9 April 1963, No. 49, <i>State Commissioner of Sicily v. President of Sicily</i> (C).....	151
3.1.2.	Constitutional Court (<i>Corte Costituzionale</i>), Judgment of July 1969, No. 120, <i>State Commissioner of Sicily v. Sicily</i> (C)	152

3.1.3.	Constitutional Court (<i>Corte Costituzionale</i>), Judgment of 30 March 1995, No. 94, <i>State Commissioner of Sicily v. Sicily</i> (C)	153
3.1.4.	Constitutional Court (" <i>Corte Costituzionale</i> "), Judgment of 29 April 1996, No. 134, <i>State Commissioner of Sicily v. Sicily</i> (II Foro Italiano, 1996, I, 2980) (C)	153
3.1.5.	Constitutional Court (<i>Corte Costituzionale</i>), Judgment of 22 July 1996, No. 271, <i>State Commissioner of Sicily v. Sicily</i> (C)	154
3.2.	Proceedings before Civil Courts	155
3.2.1.	Civil Supreme Court (<i>Corte di Cassazione</i>), Judgment of 11 December 1978, No. 5939, <i>State Financial Administration v. Oleificio S. Leonardo</i> (B)	155
3.2.2.	Civil Supreme Court (<i>Corte di Cassazione</i>), Judgment of 23 May 1980, No. 3397, <i>Comafrika S.p.A. v. Smo-Società Mercantile Oltremare</i> (G)	156
3.2.3.	Court of First Instance of Trento (<i>Tribunale di Trento</i>), Judgment of 15 November 1980, <i>Denkavit Italiana Srl v. Ministry of Finances</i> (B)	157
3.2.4.	Court of First Instance of Cagliari (<i>Tribunale di Cagliari</i>), Judgment of 14 April 1992, <i>Nuova Cartiera di Arbatax S.p.a.</i> (A)	157
3.2.5.	Court of First Instance of Genova (<i>Tribunale di Genova</i>), Order (" <i>Ordinanza</i> ") of 26 April 1993, <i>Grandi traghetti di navigazione S.p.A. v. Viamare di navigazione S.p.a. and Finmare S.p.a.</i> (F)	158
3.3.	Procedures before Administrative Courts	159
3.3.1.	Administrative Court of Lazio (<i>T.A.R. del Lazio</i>) – Sec.: III — Judgment of 22 January 1985, No. 103, <i>Società Cooperativa Trasporto Latte and others v. Banca Nazionale del Lavoro</i> (A)	159
3.3.2.	Administrative Court of Sicily (<i>T.A.R. della Sicilia</i>) — Palermo - Sec.: I - Judgment of 18 November 1986, No. 875, <i>Società Enosicilia and Consorzio produttori vini siciliani cooperativa v. Istituto regionale vite e vino e Assessore agricoltura e foreste Regione siciliana</i> (A)	160
3.3.3.	Administrative Court of Lombardia (<i>T.A.R. della Lombardia</i>) — Milan — Sec.: I, Judgment of 2 December 1986, No. 949, <i>Bozzi and others v. Ente Ferrovie dello Stato - FF.SS. (Italian Railways) and the President of the Council of Ministers</i> (C)	161
3.3.4.	Administrative Court of Tuscany (<i>T.A.R. della Toscana</i>), Judgment of 23 October 1987, No. 1166 [and Order of 23 October 1987, No. 1167], <i>Società Du Pont de Nemours Italiana v. U.S.L. No. 2 of Carrara, Società 3M Italia, Du Pont de Nemours Deutschland GmbH</i> (D)	162
3.3.5.	Administrative Courte of Friuli Venezia Giulia (<i>T.A.R. del Friuli-Venezia-Giulia</i>), Judgment of 31 December 1987,	

	No. 394, <i>Industria farmaceutica lucana and other v. U.S.L. No. 11 of Pordenone</i> (B)	163
3.3.6.	Administrative Court of Puglia (T.A.R. Puglia), Bari, Sec.: I, Judgment of 26 October 1988, No. 255, <i>Società Roussel Maestretti v. U.S.L. BA/12 and other</i> (D)	164
3.3.7.	Administrative Court of Veneto (T.A.R. Veneto), Sec.: II, Judgment of 26 July 1989, No. 1102, <i>Compagnia OASI di Malcesine v. Veneto and others</i> (A)	165
3.3.8.	Administrative Court of Lazio (T.A.R. Lazio), Rome, Sec.: III; Judgment of 11 June 1990, No. 1071, <i>Società Fonderia A. v. Ministero dell'Industria and others</i> (A)	166
3.3.9.	Council of State (<i>Consiglio di Stato</i>), Sec.: VI, Judgment of 15 October 1996, No. 1331, <i>President of the Council of Ministers, Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare, Ministry of the Treasury, Ministry of Finances v. Istituto di Vigilanza Città di Pescara and others</i> (B)	167
3.4.	Procedures before the Italian Auditors' Court (<i>Corte dei conti</i>)	167
3.4.1.	Auditors' Court (<i>Corte dei conti</i>), Sec.: Contributi Stato, Decision of 5 November 1991, No. 105, <i>Ministry of Defense</i> (C)	167
3.4.2.	Auditors' Court (<i>Corte dei conti</i>), Sec.: Contributi Enti, Report to the Parliament of 16 March 1993, No. 3, <i>Unione Nazionale Incremento Razze Equine (UNIRE) ed enti ippici</i> (C)	167
3.4.3.	Auditors' Court (<i>Corte dei conti</i>), Sec.: Contributi, Decision of 23 March 1994, No. 18, <i>Ministry of the Treasury</i> (C)	168

LUXEMBOURG

2.	Outline on the availability of judicial relief under the legal system of Luxembourg	171
2.1.	Procedures concerning the direct effect of Article 93(3)	171
2.1.1.	Procedures before administrative courts	171
2.2.	Procedures before civil courts	173
2.2.1.	Proceedings against the public authority which granted the aid	173
2.2.2.	Proceedings against the recipient of State aid	175
2.2.3.	The enforcement of negative Commission decisions	176
2.2.4.	The implementation of positive Commission decisions	177
3.	List of cases and summary	177
3.1.	Decision of the State Council dated 11 April, 1989 (A)	177

NETHERLANDS

2.	Report on the availability of judicial remedies at Dutch courts in the field of State aids.....	181
2.1.	Introduction	181
2.2.	Actions for damages.....	181
2.3.	Request for an injunction.....	182
2.4.	Action for annulment of the decision to grant aid	182
2.5.	Action against levies.....	183
2.6.	Action by agency to recover aid/enforcement of Commission decisions.....	184
3.	List of cases and summaries	184
3.1.	District Court Amsterdam	184
3.2.	District Court The Hague	185
3.3.	Supreme Court (Hoge Raad).....	186
3.4.	President of the District Court of The Hague (H).....	187
3.5.	Court of Appeal for Trade and Industry (College van Beroep voor het Bedrijfsleven).....	187
3.6.	Court of Appeal for Trade and Industry (B)	188
3.7.	President of the District court of The Hague (B)	189

PORTUGAL

2.1.	Procedures concerning the direct effect of Article 93(3).....	193
2.2.	Procedures concerning the enforcement of negative Commission decisions.....	197
2.3.	Procedures concerning the implementation of positive Commission decisions.....	199
3.	Cases	199

SPAIN

2.	Outline on the availability of judicial relief under the legal system of Spain	203
2.1.	Procedures concerning the direct effect of Article 93(3).....	203
2.2.	Procedures concerning the enforcement of negative Commission decisions.....	204
2.3.	Procedures concerning the implementation of positive Commission decisions.....	205
2.4.	Special procedure under Defense of Competition Act	205
3.	List of cases and summaries	207
3.1.	Judgment of the Administrative Division of the Supreme Court (<i>Sala de lo Contencioso-administrativo del Tribunal Supremo</i>) of the 10 th October 1989 (decision not subject to further appeal) (D).....	207
3.2.	Judgment of the Administrative Division of the Supreme Court (<i>Sala de lo Contencioso-administrativo del Tribunal Supremo</i>) of the 26 th December 1990 (decision not subject to further appeal) (B)	208
3.3.	Judgment of the Administrative Division of the Supreme Court (<i>Sala de lo Contencioso-administrativo del Tribunal Supremo</i>) of 15 th January 1997 (decision not subject to	

	further appeal) (B)	209
3.4.	Judgment of the Administrative Division of the Supreme Court (<i>Sala de lo Contencioso-administrativo del Tribunal Supremo</i>) of 2 nd March 1997 (decision not subject to further appeal) (B)	209
3.5.	Order of the Administrative Division of the Superior Court of the Community of Valencia (<i>Sala de lo Contencioso- administrativo del Tribunal Superior de Justicia de Valencia</i>) of 24 th June 1991 and Judgment of the Court of Justice of the European Communities of 15 th March 1994 (The Spanish court did not take a decision on the case because the appeal was withdrawn after the European Court's decision) (B)	210
3.6.	Decision of the Tribunal for the Defence of Competition (administrative court) (<i>Tribunal de Defensa de la Competencia</i>) of 26 th June 1995 (decision subject to further appeal) (D).....	211
3.7.	Decision of the Tribunal for the Defence of Competition (administrative court) (<i>Tribunal de Defensa de la Competencia</i>) of 27 th July 1995 (decision subject to further appeal) (D)	212

SWEDEN

2.	Member State system	217
2.1.	Procedures concerning the direct effect of Article 93(3).....	217
	2.1.1. Procedures before administrative courts	217
	2.1.2. Procedures before civil courts	218
2.2.	The enforcement of negative Commission decisions	219
2.3.	Procedures concerning the implementation of positive Commission decisions.....	219
3.	Member State cases	220

UNITED KINGDOM

2.	Indicate whether procedures are available in the UK concerning (i) the direct effect of Article 93(3), (ii) the enforcement of negative Commission decisions (actions instituted by Member States, by the beneficiary, by competitors), and (iii) the implementation of positive Commission decisions	223
2.1.	Judicial Review.....	223
2.2.	Writ actions brought by individuals	225
2.3.	Recovery of illegal State aid by the Government	226
3.	List of UK cases	227
3.1.	Re an application by Peninsula Securities Ltd for judicial review, the High Court of Justice in Northern Ireland, Queens Bench Division (Crown Side), judgment of 11 June 1998. (D)	227
3.2.	R v Customs and Excise Commissioners, ex parte Lunn Poly Limited and another, Queen's Bench Division (Divisional Court) [1998] STC 649, judgment of 2 April 1998 (B)	230
3.3.	R v Secretary of State for National Heritage and another, ex parte John Paul Getty Trust (Court of Appeal) 27 October 1994 (unreported) (D).....	231
3.4.	Department of Trade and Industry v British Aerospace plc and Rover Group Holdings plc [1991] 1CMLR 165 (A)	233

3.5.	R v Attorney General, ex parte ICI plc ([1987] 1 CMLR 72 (Court of Appeal)) (D)	234
------	--	-----

SECTION 4 – Analysis of Jurisprudence..... 237

4.	Summary and analysis of case law	239
4.1.	Cases not involving competitor actions.....	240
4.1.1.	Recovery actions by national authorities	240
4.1.2.	Most frequent cases : imposition of discriminatory (tax) burdens.....	241
4.1.3.	Cases involving institutional disputes	242
4.2.	Actions by competitors	242
4.2.1.	Actions for annulment of aid decisions against Member States.....	243
4.2.2.	Injunctive relief against Member States.....	244
4.2.3.	Damage actions against Member States or beneficiaries...	245
4.2.4.	Action/injunction by competitor against aid beneficiary.....	245
4.2.5.	Injunctive relief against beneficiaries in public procurement	247
4.3.	Summary and recommendations.....	247

Table I : Availability of remedies for competitors (results of Section 2) 249

Table II : Analysis of court decisions (results of Section 3)..... 250